

2021 DelDOT Lessons Learned Workshop: Guardrail/MASH Updates

March 8, 2021



### Agenda

- MASH Implementation
- Standard Construction Detail Updates
  - Guardrail
    - Common Field Issues
  - Concrete Barrier
- Approved Products List





#### **MASH Implementation**

- Anticipated manufacturers would develop MASH-compliant devices
- No sunset requirements of NCHRP 350 devices
- Safety benefits not realized

#### • 2016 MASH

- FHWA/AASHTO Joint Implementation Agreement
- Sunset dates of NCHRP-350 roadside hardware
  - 12/31/2017: W-beam barriers and cast-in-place concrete barriers
  - 6/30/2018: W-beam terminals
  - 12/31/2018: Cable barriers, cable barrier terminals and crash cushions
  - 12/31/2019: Bridge rails, transitions, all other longitudinal barriers, all other terminals, sign supports and all other breakaway hardware



Specific requirements for work zone devices dependent on normal service life



#### **MASH Compliance**

- MASH Compliance is determined by the <u>User</u> <u>Agency</u>.
- Excerpts from an April 9, 2018 FHWA memo to Division Administrators, Federal Lands Division Engineers and Directors of Field Services:
  - The FHWA's longstanding policy is that all roadside safety hardware installed on the NHS be crashworthy.
  - Roadside safety hardware is eligible for Federal funding if it has been determined to be crashworthy by the user agency (i.e. <u>State DOT</u>).
  - It is each <u>State's responsibility</u> to determine crashworthiness and to approve new or modified roadside safety hardware meeting the State's specific needs.
  - The determination of crashworthiness of roadside safety hardware, acceptance for use on highway projects, and installation and maintenance are responsibilities handled at the **State and local level**.



Directors of Field Services

PURPOSE

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide guidance to the FHWA Division Offices to assist in their evaluation that a State DOT has an acceptable process for determining the crashworthiness of roadside safety hardware used on the National Highway System (NHS).

#### BACKGROUND

The FHWA's longstanding policy is that all roadside safety hardware installed on the NHS be crashworthy. To support this policy, the joint implementation agreement for the American Association of State Highway Transportation Officials (AASHTO) Manual for Assessing Safety Hardware (MASH) was adopted by AASHTO and FHWA. This agreement established dates for implementing AASHTO MASH as the criteria for determining crashworthiness of roadside safety hardware.

The FHWA continues to provide a voluntary service of reviewing crash test results and issues eligibility letters for *new* roadside safety hardware only. The FHWA no longer provides Federal-aid eligibility letters for modifications made to an AASHTO MASHcrash tested device. An eligibility letter is not a requirement for roadside safety hardware to be determined eligible for Federal funding. Roadside safety hardware is eligible for Federal funding if it has been determined to be crashworthy by the user agency (i.e., State DOT).

An FHWA eligibility letter should not be the sole basis for a State's determination of crashworthiness. It is each State's responsibility to determine crashworthiness and to approve new or modified roadside safety hardware meeting the State's specific needs. Each State should consider its own operational issues such as installation and

## **DelDOT's MASH Implementation Status**

#### Status of DelDOT meeting the FHWA/AASHTO Sunset Dates

- ✓ W-Beam Barrier
- ✓ W-Beam Terminals
- Approved Products List https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlists/pdfs/APL\_EndTerminals.pdf?cache=1603198531574
- ✓ Cast-in-Place Concrete Barrier
- ✓ Cable Barrier and Cable Barrier Terminals
- Crash Cushions (Permanent Impact Attenuators)
- ✓ Bridge Railing
- ✓ Transitions
- All other longitudinal barriers
- ✓ All other terminals
- X Sign supports
- X Other Breakaway Hardware

2020 Standard Specifications require MASH compliant devices

NCHRP 350 Devices in use until suitable MASH compliant devices are available



2

Work Zone Devices See Approved Products List for Delaware specific sunset dates https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlists/pdfs/APL\_TTCDevices.pdf?cache=1603198772332

Approved Products List <u>https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlists/pdfs/APL\_ImpactAttenuator</u> s.pdf?cache=1603198475022

2020 Standard Specifications require MASH compliant devices

#### **DelDOT MASH Committee**

#### • MASH Committee

- Policy Implement
- Purpose of committee
  - Primary technical group regarding roadside safety hardware
  - Development of standard details regarding roadside safety hardware
  - Recommendations of roadside safety hardware for the Approved Products Lists
  - Review of crash testing paperwork
  - Establishment of Delaware specific sunset dates
  - Review/recommendation for approval of self-certification documents
  - Review/recommendations for approval of devices that are exempt from MASH certification



### **DelDOT MASH Committee**

#### • MASH Committee

- Roadside safety hardware approval
  - If hardware has approved crash testing from a recognized national crash testing facility, device may be approved without self certification.
  - Hardware requiring self certification
    - Document why crash tested hardware cannot be used
    - Justification with appropriate engineering calculations regarding why the proposed hardware is acceptable
    - Prepared by the DelDOT group that is the appropriate subject matter expert
    - Reviewed and voted on by the MASH Committee
    - If approved, signed by the DelDOT SME, Committee Chair and forwarded to Chief Engineer for review and approval.



DeIDOT's Engineering Support section has been working to update all guardrail and barrier standard construction details to be MASH compliant. DeIDOT historically has maintained standard construction details for cast-in-place and sip formed 32-inch tall F-shape concrete median barriers. The Department desires to add 36-inch and 42-inch single slope barrier to its standard construction details. The purpose of this memorandum is to document the development of the new concrete barrier standard construction details and to provide a recommendation as to their crashworthiness in accordance with MASH standards.

Summary of testing on height determination by Test Levels: The Texas Transportation Institute (TTI) conducted research regarding bridge railing and barrier heights based on MASH crash testing procedures. Report TTI 9-1002.05<sup>1</sup> found that the minimum height for a Test Level 4 bridge railing or barrier is 38-inches. The research conducted a fullscale crash test on a 38-inch tall single slope bridge railing. The test, conducted using a single-unit truck, was passed successfully. The report indicates that while a single slope barrier was used in the testing, the results are considered applicable to other safety shapes, e.g. the New Jersey shape and F-shape profiles. Based on this information, it was determined for the purposes of DeIDOT s Standard Construction Details, the minimum height for a TL-4 barrier would be 38-inches for median and roadside applications. In addition, a 42-inch tall TL-4 barrier detail was developed for

<sup>1</sup> TTI Report 9-1002.05 https://static.tti.tamu.edu/tti.tamu.edu/documents/9-1002-5.pdf

1013 Centre Road, Suite 302

www.wrallp.com · Phone: 302.571.9001 · Fax: 302.571.9011

N:\32128-032\Corresp\Memos\Memo\_DelDOT Barrier Detail Summary\_07-21-2020.docx

Wilmington, Delaware 19805



#### **Guardrail Details**

- Update Summary
  - Overall MASH compliance review
    - Updated existing details as needed
    - Eliminated non-compliant details
    - Maintained some NCHRP 350 compliant details as needed
  - Remove metric dimensions
  - New details
    - Type 1-31 Guardrail with Omitted Post
      - With and without curb
    - Type 1-31 Guardrail on Steep Slope
    - Type 3-31 Guardrail-to-Barrier Connection
      - Includes Concrete Buttresses
    - End Anchorage, Type 31
    - Buried-in-Backslope, Type 31





#### **Guardrail Details**

2020 Standard Construction Details: Guardrail

- B-1: Guardrail Applications
  - Type 1-31, 2-31, 3-31; Plan, Elevation and Section Views
  - Type 1-31 Guardrail with Omitted Post
  - Type 1-31 Guardrail on Steep Slope
- B-2: Grading for Guardrail End Treatments (Types 1, 2 and 3)
- B-3: Guardrail over Culverts (Types 1-31, 2-31 and 3-31)
- B-4: End Anchorage, Type 1-31
- B-7: W-Beam, Type 1-27 to Type 1-31 Transition Section
- B-8: Guardrail to Barrier Connection Approach and Exit Type 31
- B-10: Guardrail to Barrier Connection Type 3-31
- B-13: Hardware
- B-15: Guardrail Applications (Types 1-27, 2-27 and 3-27)
- B-17: Guardrail End Treatment, Type 4-27
- B-18: Curved Guardrail Section, Type 1-27
- B-20: Buried in Back Slope End Terminal, Type 1-31



- Detail B-1: Guardrail **Applications** 
  - Type 1-31: 4'-0" deflection
  - Type 2-31: 2'-6" deflection
  - No break-away hardware in the deflection zone
    - Interaction between guardrail deflection and breakaway hardware has not







- Detail B-1: Guardrail Applications
  - Type 1-31
    - Also known as Midwest Guardrail System (MGS)
    - Standard guardrail application, basis for all other guardrail details
    - Guardrail height = 31"
    - Post spacing = 6'-3" or 75"
    - 12" Offset Blocks
    - Minimum clearance to obstruction = 4'-0"
    - Guardrail splices midspan
    - MASH Compliant system
  - Type 2-31
    - Half post spacing, 3'-1 ½" or 37.5"
    - Minimum clearance to obstruction = 3'-0"
    - Not compliant with MASH; testing still underway
  - Type 3-31
    - Median guardrail (double sided)
    - 8" Offset Blocks
    - Standard post spacing
    - MASH compliant system



# • Detail B-1: Guardrail Applications





8/19/2020



13











• Detail B-1, Sheet 4: Type 1-31 Guardrail with Omitted Post





8/19/2020





• Detail B-1, Sheet 4: Type 1-31 Guardrail with Omitted Post

Location of omitted post within proximity of an end terminal is critical





### **Design Considerations**

- Guardrail with Omitted Post
  - Use only where <u>one</u> post needs to be omitted
    - Curb openings
    - Span an underground utility conflict
- Guardrail over Culvert
  - Use to span pipe or box culverts
  - Unsupported span lengths between 12'-6" and 25'-0"
  - Max span length 25'-0"







#### • Post omission must follow new standard detail

- Plan curb openings at appropriate locations
- Some guardrail layout in design and in field may be necessary to avoid post omissions







#### • Guardrail Post Leave Outs

- Used if guardrail post is placed in concrete
- Allows the post to rotate and deflect upon impact
- Previously tested and passed NCHRP 350
- Recent MASH testing by TTI for both steel & wood post guardrail systems
  - Both car and truck tests passed MASH for steel post
  - Wood post test failed the pickup truck test
- Leave out requires a low strength grout
  - 1 part Type 1A cement, 14 parts sand, 5 parts water, by volume
  - No additives







https://www.roadsidepooledfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/TRNo608551-1-45-Final.pdf

 Detail B-1, Sheet 5: Type 1-31 on a Steep Slope





Curb height 2" MAX

- Detail B-2: Grading for Guardrail End Treatment, Type 1
  - See Approved Products List for allowable systems

https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlist s/pdfs/APL\_EndTerminals.pdf?cache =1603391579291





SCALE : NTS

- Detail B-2: Grading for Guardrail End Treatment, Type 2
  - See Approved Products List for allowable systems

https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlist s/pdfs/APL\_EndTerminals.pdf?cache =1603391579291





- Detail B-2: Grading for Guardrail End Treatment, Type 3
  - See Approved Products List for allowable systems

https://deldot.gov/Business/prodlist s/pdfs/APL\_EndTerminals.pdf?cache =1603391579291









### **Guardrail End Treatments**

- Common Inspection Issues
  - Grading around and in advance of the terminal
    - This is extremely important for the terminal to function correctly and for the striking vehicle to not rollover
    - Curb must be eliminated or lowered per the detail
    - Area behind the terminal must be clear of fixed objects, including breakaway devices
  - End treatment installation
    - Install per manufacturer instructions
    - Strut between posts 1 and 2 must be at ground level
    - Bearing plate oriented properly
    - Flare rate for end treatment





#### **Guardrail End Treatments**

#### • New Style End Treatments

- Trinity Safe Stop
  - Extruded rail at bottom of end treatment, lays flat on ground
  - Post 1 and 2 are not installed in line with each other
- MAX-Tension from Barrier Systems
  - Energy absorbing end treatment
  - Downstream "coupler" which absorbs energy and cuts the downstream rail sections upon impact
  - Special bolts for coupler, must be installed correctly to work properly





#### **Guardrail Transitions**

 Detail B-7: Transition from 1-31 to 1-27





8/19/2020

#### **Guardrail Transitions**

#### • Unacceptable method of transitioning height





#### **Approach Guardrail Transitions**

 Detail B-10: Guardrail-to-Barrier Connection, Type 3-31



Source: Midwest Roadside Safety Facility





### **Approach Guardrail Transitions**

#### • Design Considerations

- Use Type 1-31 AGT for retrofit applications at existing F-shape barrier wall attachments
- Use Type 3-31 AGT for new construction or where it is desirable to construct the concrete buttress
- Consult MASH Committee and/or Bridge Design for retrofit situations where the Type 3-31 AGT may be beneficial





#### **Barrier Hardware**



8/19/2020

#### **Concrete Barrier Details**

- Update Summary
  - Overall MASH compliance review
    - Resulted in elimination of existing concrete barrier details
  - Added new concrete barrier details
    - Address common Department uses
    - Minimizes need for project specific details
    - Roadside Concrete Barrier
      - 36" F-Shape, Single Face (Test Level 4)
      - 42" F-Shape, Single Face (Test Level 4)
    - Median Concrete Barrier
      - 32" F-Shape (Test Level 3)
      - 36" F-Shape (Test Level 4)
      - 42" F-Shape (Test Level 4)
      - 42" Single Slope (Test Level 5)
  - Designs based on available MASH crash testing and appropriate structural analyses



#### **Approved Products List**

#### Guardrail End Treatments and Permanent Impact Attenuators must be on APL to be used on a project

#### Delaware Department of Transportation Approved Products List W-Beam Guardrail End Terminals

Standard Item				масы			
2001 Standard	2016 Standard	Manufacturer	Product Name	Test Level	Tangent	Flared	Letter
Specifications	Specifications			Test Level			Letter
720585	721000	Barrier Systems by Lindsay	MAX-Tension	TL-2	х		CC-134
720585	721001	Barrier Systems by Lindsay	MAX-Tension	TL-3	Х		CC-133
720588	721004	Barrier Systems by Lindsay	MAX-Tension Median	TL-3	х		CC-141
720585	721000	Road Systems, Inc.	MASH Sequential Kinking Terminal	TL-2	x		CC-126D
			(MSKT)				
720585	721001	Road Systems, Inc.	MASH Sequential Kinking Terminal	TL-3	x		CC-126, 126A,
			(MSKT)				126C, CC-126F
720585	721000	Trinity Highway Products, LLC	SoftStop System	TL-2	x		CC-115B, 115E,
							115H, 115I
720585	721001	Trinity Highway Products, LLC	SoftStop System	TL-3	x		CC-115, 115A,
							115D, 115G,
							115H, 115I
720586	721003	Road Systems, Inc.	Flared Energy Absorbing Terminal (MFLEAT)	TL-3		x	CC-143

End terminals not listed above shall not be used on any DelDOT construction contracts without prior written approval from the DelDOT Safety Programs Manager, who is responsible for the above Approved Products List (APL).

All manufacturers and distributors seeking approval for new products must submit a completed copy of the DelDOT APL new product evaluation form, product materials technical data sheet, installation instructions, material safety data sheet, and copies of all related FHWA approval letters.

The ET-Plus® System end terminals manufactured by Trinity Highway Products are not permitted for use on any DelDOT construction contracts.

#### Delaware Department of Transportation Approved Products List (MASH 2016) Permanent Impact Attenuators

Standard Item				MACH Test		
2001 Standard Specifications	2016 Standard Specifications	Manufacturer	Product Name	Level	FHWA Eligibility Letter	
720585	724002	EASI	3-Bay QuadGuard M10 (QG M10) Narrow	TL-2	CC-121, CC-112C	
720585	724002	EASI	3-Bay QuadGuard M10 (QG M10) Wide	TL-2	CC-121, CC-112C	
720585	724002	EASI	QuadGuard Elite M10; 4-Bay Standard Width	TL-2	CC-112A, CC-112C	
720585	724002	EASI	QuadGuard Elite M10; 4-Bay Wide Backup Width	TL-2	CC-112A, CC-112C	
720585	724005	EASI	QuadGuard Elite M10; 8-Bay Standard Width	TL-3	CC-112A, CC-112C	
720585	724005	EASI	QuadGuard Elite M10; 8-Bay Wide Backup Width	TL-3	CC-112A, CC-112C	
720585	724005	EASI	2-Bay to 6-Bay QuadGuard M10 CZ (24", 30" and 36")	TL-3	CC-112B, CC-112C	
720585	724005	Energy Absorption Systems, Inc.	6-Bay QuadGuard M10	TL-3	CC-112, CC-112C	
720585	724005	Energy Absorption Systems, Inc.	6-Bay QuadGuard M10 Wide	TL-3	CC-112, CC-112C	
720517	724006	Work Area Protection	SCI SmartCushion <sup>®</sup> TL-3 SCI100GM Impact Attenuator	TL-3	CC-128	
720585	724002	Lindsay Transportation Solutions, Inc.	Universal TAU-M MASH Crash Cushion	TL-2	CC-146	
720585	724005	Lindsay Transportation Solutions, Inc.	Universal TAU-M MASH Crash Cushion	TL-3	CC-147	





## **Thank you!**

Adam Weiser, PE, PTOE, RSP Whitman, Requardt & Associates, LLP <u>aweiser@wrallp.com</u> (302) 485-0863 (direct line)

